



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

REVIEWS AND NOTICES

*The Leading Facts of New Mexican History.*¹ By Ralph Emerson Twitchell. Volume I. (Cedar Rapids, Iowa: The Torch Press. 1911. Pp. xxi, 506.)

With its elaborate footnotes, bibliographies, and facsimiles of manuscripts, this beautifully printed and bound book conveys at first sight the impression that it is the result of much original investigation, and as such it has been represented by uncritical reviewers. But closer examination shows that it is nothing of the sort. The book is, as a matter of fact, purely a compilation, and of the simpler kind, most of the text being either a close paraphrase or a direct copy of two works. If the borrowing had been duly acknowledged, the book would have been welcomed and judged on its merits as a compilation; but it is unfortunately the case that the compiler, while making much show of citation and quotation of supplementary matter in the footnotes, has, either in ignorance or flagrant disregard of literary ethics, in the main concealed the sources from which he copied or paraphrased the text, and much of the footnote matter as well, thus creating an impression of independent work which he did not perform. Nor is he relieved of this charge in any important measure by his prefatory remark that "a great deal of the work . . . may best be termed editing," or by an occasional observance of the proprieties, which only serves to further mislead.

Such a statement as this can not be made without at least an indication of the evidence on which it rests, and to this end most of my space will be devoted. Chapters II, III and IV of the book in question deal with the early Spanish exploration of New Mexico. On reading the footnotes and bibliographies one misses references to Lowery's very pertinent work, *The Spanish Settlements within the Present Limits of the United States, 1513-1561*. A more careful reading, however, shows that Mr. Twitchell has by no means overlooked it. Indeed, the greater portion of the text of the one hundred ninety-nine pages comprised in these chapters is taken almost bodily from Book II, Chapters III, V and VI of

¹Reprinted from *The American Historical Review*, April, 1912.

that book, but absolutely without credit, for neither the name of Lowery nor of his book receives mention in the work. The order of presentation is identical, with few exceptions, through paragraph after paragraph, page after page, while there are hundreds, if not thousands, of identical phrases, sentences, and even large portions of paragraphs, without a single acknowledgment. Chapter III, for example, on Fray Marcos de Niza, is a paraphrase of Lowery's Chapter V. By actual count one hundred fifty-nine identical phrases or sentences were found in identical connections, although the chapter contains only about ten full pages of text; nor does this statement give an adequate impression of the closeness of the paraphrasing. Very clearly Mr. Twitchell regards Lowery as a reliable translator as well as a safe historian, for the identity extends to numerous extracts translated from the Spanish. In these cases Mr. Twitchell generally cites the same originals as Lowery (except occasionally, as where Lowery's reference to Mota Padilla III somehow becomes "Mota Padilla, 3"), but Lowery never.

Lowery's book reaches only to 1561, and Mr. Twitchell's anchor for the remainder of his text is Bancroft's *Arizona and New Mexico*. In this case the compiler's shortage of quotation marks is less obvious, because due credit is given here and there for portions borrowed—in the very paragraphs, indeed, where much greater portions are taken without credit.

Less attention has been paid by the reviewer to Chapter I, dealing with ancient New Mexico, but a casual examination shows that most of pages 4-7 and 42-50 were taken almost verbatim and altogether without credit from Hodge's *Handbook of American Indians* (part I, pp. 171-172, 305-309, 108-109, 327).

As has already been intimated, the method above described extends in liberal measure to the footnotes, also; and this applies not merely to citations, but to comments and important conclusions as well. For example, more than seventy of the notes in the last one hundred fifty pages were traced directly to Bancroft's *Arizona and New Mexico*, though no credit is given to that work. An instance, which could be paralleled by others, is note 362, where eighty-seven lines, consisting of a summary based on Vetancourt, are taken verbatim from Bancroft, pages 172-173, although the citation is to the original Spanish work. The only other explana-

tion possible would be that two independent writers could give identical summaries of a lengthy passage in a foreign language. Again, on pages 344-412 at least twenty-three notes which purport to be the result of independent work in the sources were traced directly to Bandelier's *Final Report*, parts I and II.

Another remarkable feature of the work is the citation of rare manuscripts. From the frequency of these citations and the extended comment on manuscript sources in the Prefatory Note, the reader would infer that Mr. Twitchell had really used a great deal of this class of material, in addition to printed works. But appearances are misleading here also. To begin with, many of the first-hand citations are to manuscripts in the private collection made by Mr. H. H. Bancroft, to which, we know, Mr. Twitchell never had access. In these cases, naturally, the citations can all be traced directly to Bancroft's *Arizona and New Mexico*. If space permitted, it would be easy to demonstrate by the pagination and titles of the manuscripts cited that such is the case with his references to the "Pinart Collection," notes 346, 355, 413, 445, 446; to "N. Mex. Doc.," notes 375, 461, 462, 465, 470, 474, 475; to Otermin's "Extractos," notes 349, 375, 376; to Bonilla's "Apuntes," note 465; to Morfi's "Desórdenes," note 482; to Menchero's "Declaración," note 465; and to "Moqui, Noticias," note 437. Mr. Twitchell evidently did not know that many of these citations refer to Bancroft's personal note-books, and not to the pagination of the documents in any archive; or that some of the titles are designations given to documents by Bancroft, and are applicable only to his own collection.

Again, on the period of the Pueblo revolt and the reconquest by Vargas, Twitchell not only cites first-hand but gives extensive extracts from the manuscripts entitled "Ynterrogatoria de Preguntas," "Parecer del Fiscal," "Diario del Sitio," "Diario de la Retirada," "Protesta á Don Diego de Vargas," "Carta al Padre Morfi," "Memoria del Descubrimiento," "Petición de los Vecinos de Albuquerque al Cabildo de Santa Fé," "Certificación de los Huezos del Venerable Fray Juan de Jesus," "Estado de la Misión de San Lorenzo el Real," "Autos del Año de 1694," "Relación Sumaria de las Operaciones Militares del Año de 1694," Escalante, "Relación del Nuevo Mexico," and "Autos de Guerra, 1696." These extracts, with references directly to the manuscripts, should

create the presumption that Mr. Twitchell had used a considerable body of fundamental manuscript sources for this period. But the impression is modified when we learn that in every one of the twenty-five cases in which the quotations were tested the identical extracts, with the identical references to the manuscripts, and usually with the identical notes and comments, were found in Bandelier's *Final Report*, parts I and II, though no reference is made to that scholar's work. Mr. Twitchell may have had access to these documents, but no evidence has been found that he made any independent use of them.

Such a method of appropriating the results of the work of others can be regarded in only one light by scholars; and it is due to scholars that a protest be made against its employment by those who know better, and that books produced by it by those who do not, be represented in their true light. Hence this review.

After the above statement of the sources and workmanship of Mr. Twitchell's book, it hardly need be said that, although it is a useful compilation, it adds little to our knowledge of the history of New Mexico.

HERBERT E. BOLTON.

The Life of Andrew Jackson. By John Spencer Bassett, Ph. D., Professor of History, Smith College. In two volumes. (New York: Doubleday, Page, and Company. 1911. Pp. xiii, 371; 375-766.)

This is a comprehensive study of Andrew Jackson in relation to the history of his period. Naturally, where Parton and Sumner and Brown, and Von Holst, McMaster, MacDonald, and Catterall have reaped before there must be much winnowing of old straw. But the book is abundantly justified by the contribution which it makes to our appreciation of Jackson's influence upon his age and of its influence upon him.

Sixteen chapters, covering three hundred and twenty pages, are devoted to Jackson's life prior to the presidential campaign of 1824; three additional chapters are needed to bring him to the presidency in 1829; and only fourteen remain—less than three